Elservier Publishing Campus

- Types of Revision
- First Steps
- Responding to comments
- Golden Rules
- Specific Scenarios
Getting your paper back

- Rejected without review (desk reject)
- Accept
- Minor revision
- Major revision
- Reject
First steps
Once you get your paper back.....

• Stay calm
• Read the comments
• Re-read the comments
• Get someone else to read the comments
• Take a break
• Make a table that details every comment and the changes required
Responding to comments

- Deal with minor comments first
- Deal with major comments
- Begin drafting response letter
- Golden Rules:
  - Be polite
  - Be thorough
  - Answer with evidence
Be polite

• Reviewers do this for free
• Encourages good feeling
• Makes a good impression

• Especially important if you disagree with reviewers
• Don’t use harsh language or sweeping statements”
Useful phrases

• We agree with the referee that ..., but
• The referee is right to point out ..., yet
• Whilst we agree with the referee that........
• It is true that ..., but
• We acknowledge that our paper might have been....., but
• We too were disappointed by the low response rate...
• We agree that this is an important area that requires further research.....
• We support the referee’s assertion that ...., although


Elsevier Publishing Campus
Be thorough

- Address every comment
- Do not ignore any comments
- Makes a good impression
- Clarity and structure
- Take your time
Answer with evidence

• Especially when disagreeing
• Provide extra data
• Add information to your article
Response letters

- Addressed to Editors and reviewers
- Include manuscript title and ID
- Summarize
- Address disagreements
- Be polite
Specific Scenarios

- Two reviewers disagree
- The reviewer is wrong
- Comments you don’t understand
- Rude reviewers
- Resubmit or go elsewhere?
Two reviewers disagree

- Happens often, but why?
- Ask the Editor
- Don’t use as an opportunity to play reviewers off middle ground
The reviewer is wrong

• Can happen, but why?
• Not all reviewers are equal
• Don’t agree with them
• Use the Editor as the judge
• Be polite
• Don’t presume you are right
Comments you don’t understand

• Ask
Rude reviewers

• Sadly quite common
• Rudeness or sensitivity?
• Take criticism on board
• Contact the Editor
Resubmit or go elsewhere?

- Never submit the same version of the article elsewhere
- Always use the reviewers comments
References and further reading

- 7 tips for dealing with reviewer comments. ECR2STAR. http://ecr2star.org/blog/2013/10/15/7-secrets-for-dealing-with-reviewer-comments